

## **SURAT KETERANGAN**

Nomor: 914/UNUSA/Adm-LPPM/VII/2021

Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat (LPPM) Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya menerangkan telah selesai melakukan pemeriksaan duplikasi dengan membandingkan artikel-artikel lain menggunakan perangkat lunak **Turnitin** pada tanggal 13 Juli 2021.

Judul : *Improving Students' Speaking Skill Through Youtube Video: Systematic Review*

Penulis : Mohammad Ulin Nuha, Tiyas Saputri

Identitas : Konstruktivisme: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran, Vol. 13  
No. 1, 11 Maret 2021

No. Pemeriksaan : 2021.07.21.361

Dengan Hasil sebagai Berikut:

**Tingkat Kesamaan diseluruh artikel (*Similarity Index*) yaitu 22%**

Demikian surat keterangan ini dibuat untuk digunakan sebagaimana mestinya.

Surabaya, 21 Juli 2021

Ketua LPPM



UNUSA  
LPPM

Achmad Syafiuddin, Ph.D

NPP: 20071300

# artikel

*by* Mohammad Ulin Nuha

---

**Submission date:** 05-Jul-2020 02:26PM (UTC+0700)

**Submission ID:** 1353553889

**File name:** Revisi\_Article\_Ulin\_5x\_Revisi\_dari\_bu\_Tiyas.docx (29.69K)

**Word count:** 4233

**Character count:** 23119

## IMPROVING STUDENTS' SPEAKING SKILL THROUGH YOUTUBE VIDEO: SYSTEMATIC REVIEW

8 Mohammad Ulin Nuha<sup>1</sup>  
S1 English Education Department, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education  
Nahdlatul Ulama University of Surabaya  
[4330016012@student.unusa.ac.id](mailto:4330016012@student.unusa.ac.id)

8 Tiyas Saputri, S.S., M.Pd<sup>2</sup>  
S1 English Education Department, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education  
Nahdlatul Ulama University of Surabaya  
[tiyass@unusa.ac.id](mailto:tiyass@unusa.ac.id)

### ABSTRACT

This study aims to describe a study of Improving students' speaking skill through youtube video and to collect some information relating to the use of youtube video in learning English. The method of this research was using systematic review. This study used 10 sources which consist of 3 thesis and 7 journals. Data analysis technique used in this research was data analysis techniques Descriptive Analysis Method. The data in this study are sentences. All sentences have been selected by researchers from several relevant journals and theses. Data collection is carried out by researchers by searching several journals or theses that have similarities in reading texts or research media. Data analysis using pre-test and post-test that has been investigated by researchers. The results of the study were taken from the highest value of the post-test that has been observed. The result of this study is using YouTube videos might be an alternate since it provides materials for speaking class freely and simply, therefore it helps to improve fluency in speaking of the students. Some aspects which are improved included students' fluency, vocabulary, pronunciation, grammar, and content. Youtube video media cannot only be applied to children but also can be applied to all levels and also help students practice their own speaking skill easily.

Keyword: *Youtube Video, Systematic Review, Speaking Skill*

### INTRODUCTION

In globalization era, everyone is competing to master foreign language, especially English as a tool for communication. English as a world language plays a further and additional necessary role in many elements of our life. There are four skills in English learning, they are speaking, reading listening, and writing. Mastering English, particularly speaking ability is importantly required for college students to induce used to communicating with others globally. Mostly, speaking skill is the most effective component in language mastery success because mastery of foreign languages can be seen from the way how they carry out the conversation.

Speaking is an important part of verbal communication, therefore it shall be dominant in language teaching and learning process. Even though it is important, in fact, over years speaking has not been considered important. Based on preliminary observation of language teaching practice at schools, English teachers speak English only as repetition of exercises or memorizing dialogue. It is far from meeting

Commented [h1]: Revise your result of the study, look at your statements of the problem.

the demand for speaking competency required for real life. This gap has to be fixed by more improved teaching learning process. Communicative competence is required for day-to-day communication, and such competence cannot be acquired through mastery in discrete language elements: structure, vocabulary and pronunciation. Communicative Competence refers to the ability to use language to achieve some communicative purpose, including both comprehension and expression. The preliminary survey conducted to the students who have attended speaking classes revealed that the majority of the student thought speaking is difficult, yet few of them found it easy.

The perception of English speaking difficulty is triggered by several problems they confronted when they are attempting to speak English: hard to express ideas due to lack of vocabulary, fear of making a mistake, lack of self-confidence, and teachers' negative feedback. The above mentioned survey results confirm the necessity of evaluating the speaking classes, especially to develop primary instructional material for speaking skill. It is terribly imperative and appropriate for the teacher of speaking class to create every effort to turn a number of these into positive ones according to the goal and also the conditions listed above. The researchers therefore propose YouTube to be a technique in teaching speaking from those who want to be in teaching. As a result of this platform, YouTube has been chosen to contribute many (Riswandi 2016).

YouTube is that the biggest and popular site of online video within the world. Recently, YouTube users spread across the world of all ages, from kids to the amount of adults. The users can transfer videos, search, watch videos, and discuss about videos and additionally share video clips without charge. The researchers find YouTube to be another technique for improving the skill of speaking students. When watching YouTube-based videos, students are required to get the ideas to talk from the speaker's atmosphere so that students can try to do imaginative, intensive, reactive, active, interactive to comprehensive speech performance. Speaking skill would be higher if the atmosphere or genuine content promotes it as schemas for the students. Implementation of this strategy includes the of part based pre-work, the work process, and the portion focusing on languages. This strategy is expected to help the scholars solve the problems and increase the speech achievement of the scholars. (Riswandi 2016).

Implementing audio-visual materials to advance speaking skill has been evidenced its success by Djahida (2017) that investigated the role of educational YouTube videos to improve speaking skills of EFL students to second-semester students of Biskra University. The result showed its effectiveness not only to promote students' communicative competence but also enhance their self-confidence, contextual language exposure, and vocabulary enrichment. This usage of an audio-visual material like the educational YouTube videos is not only to accelerate students' English speaking competence, but also to increase vocabulary, confidence, and English context which are the problems confronted by the students under the study. Nevertheless, her research was investigating the role of educational YouTube videos to improve speaking skills and develop the audio-visual-based speaking material which is believed to be effective in advancing students speaking skill.

According to Meinawati (2020), there are some advantages and disadvantages of YouTube for teaching speaking in the class that happen during the process of teaching. The students are more focus to the material on YouTube because it is interesting for them to learn by watching. The students are laughing when watching the video because people who make video in YouTube will make it

as interesting as possible to entertain the viewers. The disadvantage that the researcher found during the implementation of using YouTube in the class is students are easy to be distracted, whenever they see popular videos on the home page of YouTube, they want to watch it and make a noise.

The existence of visual media through YouTube videos, students additionally would like humanistic approaches will develop the English speaking skills of the students. In this situation, the students are asked to use humanistic approaches with a "supportive and cooperative group atmosphere" to help them grow a lot positive feelings towards themselves and their peers by active involvement in a positive group atmosphere. Motivation is one of the factors of personality affecting learning. It is "an inner drive that moves one to a particular action" (Saputri 2017). Therefore, the use of youtube videos is a good medium to be applied to improve speaking. Additionally, this media will bring the atmosphere of the class to be more active and interesting. The aim of this study is to explain the effect of using youtube video to improve the speaking of students and to obtain some information from the 10 sources about using youtube video. Besides, it can be used in all levels.

## RESEARCH METHODS

This study is based on Systematic literature review. Systematic literature review (SLR) may be a form of literature review that recognizes, reviews and interprets all results on a search subject in order to answer a search question previously established (Gough, 2020). A systematic review of literature is a way of defining, reviewing and analyzing all available research related to a specific research issue or subject field, or phenomenon of interest (Kitchenham, 2004). Self-study (individual study) is a form of primary study (primary study), while a systematic review is a secondary study (secondary study). Systematic review will be very useful for synthesizing various relevant research results so that the facts presented to policy makers become more comprehensive and balanced.

In general, the stages of conducting a systematic literature review (SLR) consist of 3 main parts: Planning, Conducting and Reporting (Kitchenham, 2004). Explanation of each stage is as follows.

### • Planning

In planning there are two steps that has to be done, namely formulating research questions and developing SLR protocols. Research questions are used to guide the process of finding and extracting literature whereas the SLR protocol could be a plan that contains the procedures and strategies the researcher selected in conducting SLR.

The focus of this study to find out whether youtube video is effective to improve speaking skill. For this reason, several questions were designed to obtain answers from the results of this literature study. 1) Is it effective to use youtube video as a media to improve speaking skill?, 2) What grade of education level can apply youtube video media? While developing SLR protocols in this study, the researchers used the descriptive method to explain the procedures presenting research. The procedures used by researchers are to find out whether youtube video is effective to improve speaking skill, the difference of the research result from one source to another source and the grade of education level can apply youtube video media.

### • Conduction

At this stage, the SLR protocol, a plan that contains of the procedures and strategies that the researcher has chosen to implement the SLR. The process starts from discovering population, methods, and differences between one researcher and

other researchers. Additionally, the researcher applies procedures and strategies that are created, begin from mention of the population, and additionally the results of analysis to answer the questions that are formulated.

- Reporting

The last stage is that the stage of writing the results of previous related literature written form, either to be published within the form of papers or scientific journals or to compile Chapter two on Literature Review in a thesis / dissertation. The structure of writing an SLR usually consists of three main elements, specifically: Introduction (Main), Main (Main Body) and Conclusions (Conclusions).

Data collection techniques in this study are documentation. It is looking for data about things or variables in the form of notes, books, papers or articles, journals and so on (Arikunto, 2010). Sources of data used as research material consisted of theses, journals and internet sites related to the chosen topic. The data source of this study was 10 consisting of 3 theses about Improving students' speaking skill through youtube video. The sources are: 1. *The Effectiveness of Using Video Youtube Toward Students' Speaking Ability at The Second Grade of Mts Psm Mirigambar, Tulungagung* by Lia Selfia Yunita from English Education Department Faculty of Tarbiyah And Teacher Training State Islamic Institute IAIN Tulungagung 2015, 2. *The Effectiveness of Using Youtube Video on the Second Grade Students' Speaking Ability In Recount Text at Mts Assyafi'iyah Gondang* by Rizka Alfi Qurrota A'yunina from English Education Department Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teachers Training State Islamic Institute (IAIN) Tulungagung 2018), 3. *Utilizing YouTube Videos to Enhance Students' Speaking Skill: A Classroom Action Research at the Grade Students of SMK Negeri 3 Surakarta* by Muhammad Sirrul Muna from Teacher Training and Education Faculty Sebelas Maret University Surakarta 2011).

The data source of this study also consisted of 7 journals about using youtube video, the journals were: 1. *The Development of Educational Youtube Videos-Based Instructional Material for Speaking for Beginner Course* by Syifa' Khuriyatuz Zahro and Fariq Shiddiq Tasauy from Department of English Education, Darul 'Ulum Islamic University Lamongan, Indonesia published in IJET Volume 8, Issue 2, Desember 2019, 2. *Use of YouTube-Based Videos to Improve Students' Speaking Skill* by Diki Riswandi from English Education Department, The Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia published in Proceeding The 2nd International Conference On Teacher Training and Education Sebelas Maret University, Volume 2, Number 1, 2016, 3. *English Youtube Channel in Enhancing Students' Speaking Skill* by Yunda Lestari from English Education Study Program, University of Baturaja-Indonesia published in Exposure Journal, Vol. 8, No.1, May 2019, 4. *The Impact of Youtube, Skype And Whatsapp In Improving EFL Learners' Speaking Skill* by Elhadi Nasr Elhadi Mustafa from Sudan University of Science and Technology-College of Graduate Studies published in International Journal of Contemporary Applied Researches Vol. 5, No. 5, May 2018, 5. *Increasing English Speaking Skills Through Youtube* by Euis Meinawati, Nazzala Aulia Rahmah, Danang Dwi Harmoko, Nurmala Dewi from Universitas Bina Sarana Informatika, Jakarta Barat, Dki Jakarta published in Jurnal Ilmiah Vol 16, No 1 Jan 2020, 6. *YouTube Channel: An Alternative Social Media to Enhance EFL Students' Speaking Skill* by Muhammad Ilyas and Miranti Eka Putri from English language study program of Universitas Islam 2020 published in J-SHMIC : Journal of English for Academic, 7. *Teaching Using Youtube Tutorial Video to Improve Students' Speaking Skills* by Ida Prasetianing Jati, Alis Saukah, Nunung



Suryati from English Language Teaching-Universitas Negeri Malang published in Jurnal Pendidikan Humaniora Volume 7, Number 3, September 2019.

In this study, data analysis technique used in this research was data analysis techniques Descriptive Analysis Method which is an attempt to collect and compile a data then an analysis of the data was carried out. The opinion of the descriptive data analysis is the data collected in the form of words and pictures not in the form of numbers. That is induced by the use of qualitative methods. However, it's possible that anything gathered would be the secret to what was researched. In this way, the research report will include data fragments to provide an summary of the port 's presentation.

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Based on the sources above, the researchers made sure whether the use of youtube video is effective or not as a media to improve speaking skill. They presented some sources based on the data collected on the result of using youtube video media.

The first was Yunita's research (2015). In her research, the research finding in this research could be seen from the Youtube video <sup>2</sup>st scores of students increased from before to after treatment was given. The mean score of speaking before being instructed by video YouTube is enough a <sup>2</sup>a result of the mean score of sixteen students is fifty eight .4375. Once obtaining treatment <sup>2</sup> the mean score of speaking ability is sixty seven .8125 supported the standards of the students' score is sweet score it absolutely was improved, with the t-test analysis that employed by research <sup>2</sup>r, the results of t Count is by examination the t Table that she <sup>2</sup>as in spss sixteen.0, T Count 6.895 and worth of t Table on the score table t zero,01 1.753 , it means that t Count is way larger than t Table ( t Count > t Table ) = ( six.895 > 1.753).

The <sup>2</sup>second was A'yunina's research (2018). The results of this analysis indicated: (1) the students' mean score of prete <sup>2</sup> in control category was forty nine.06 and also the mean of posttest was fifty six.17. (2) the students' mean score of pretest <sup>2</sup> experimental category was fifty one.06 and also the mean of posttest fifty nine.86. (3) there was totally different score between control category and experimental category. There was shown score F-test computation by using SPSS program 23.0 version was 0.76 and it was bigger than F-table 0.05. <sup>3</sup>

The third was Muna's research (2011). The analysis findings presented that YouTube video might improve students' speaking ability and class situation. The common score in pre-test is thirty seven.225, in Cycle one sixty seven.45 and the post test seventy three <sup>3</sup>40 with KKM sixty five.00. It implied that the results of this analysis was using YouTube videos by some techniques like pause and play combined by some strategies like drilling might improve students' speaking ability and state of affairs of the class.

The fourth was Zahro's research (2019). The result of the analysis revealed that the questionnaire yielded that the students preferred the use of audio-visual materials (100%) for speaking classes other than text or course book with no speaking model. All of the students agreed (93%) and strongly agreed (7%) the need for a speaking model that encouraged them to speak English like native-speaker.

The fifth was Riswandi's research <sup>1</sup>(2016). The result of this task taken by the teacher by assessment, examination, questionnaire and interview is the following: first, based on the observation of the teachers when the video was played, the majority of the students paid attention to the screen. It was found that at the first and

second sessions, average 80 per cent-95 per cent of the students paid attention to the video. The students speaking test result has been improved although it has not been so significant. The average score of the students speaking test in the preliminary analysis was 65.1 out of 28 students while the highest score was 71. However, from 28 students the average speaking score in Cycle 1 was 71.7 while the overall score is 75.

The sixth was Lestari's research (2019). The result provided that the Youtube English Channel greatly enhanced the speaking capacity of the students. It was further presented that the typical to increase from pre-test to post-test. The investigator collected post-test results of increasing control and experimental groups when the procedure was performed. From the information obtained, a small discrepancy was provided by the post-test scores of the students inside the control group. The mean score was changed marginally, and increasing. From previous results, the author presumed greater progress was provided by the speaking score of the students in the experimental class.

The seventh was Mustafa's research (2018). The findings of the study: This can be inferred that students will develop their English spoken language by Skype as students will be able to practice real conversations while YouTube will develop listening skills based on seeing and listening to videos and WhatsApp depends on sending videos and audio and interacting.

The eighth was Euis's research (2020). The result of using YouTube as a media can be a strong alternate method for teaching classroom speaking. Students are speaking more expressively in this way, and do not need to think about the words they use while speaking. The way students imitate native speakers is easy for them to speak confidently in English. They are no doubt frustrated, since they have the ability to speak English as a native speaker. This can be seen from the outcome of their first meeting and last meeting mean performance rate.

The ninth was Ilyas' research (2020). There was an improvement of students' speaking skill after using YouTube channel in the class. Based on the data of SPSS, it could be seen that the value of sig. (2-tailed) was 0,000 which was not greater than the probability value of 0.05. In other word, it could be read  $0.000 < 0.05$ . Based on the score, the researcher concluded that  $H_0$  was rejected and  $H_1$  was accepted means that there was significant effect of YouTube channel towards students' speaking skill.

The tenth was Jati's research (2019). The average score of thirteen students obtained the scores ranging between 40 and 63 and the average score was 68. The results of the study presented that the students' speaking ability was up in 3 aspects accuracy, fluency, performance.

Based on the results above, using youtube video to improve speaking skill can be one of the techniques in improving students' speaking skill which can be used by teachers. Based on the information above, it presented that there was a very big difference of the test results taken by researchers before and after doing treatment by using pre-test and post-test. In the result of Riswandi's research, he distributed test for student. The teachers' observation once the video was played, most of the scholars paid attention to the screen. It had been found that averagely eightieth - ninety fifth of the scholars paid attention to the video at the first and the second meeting. This finding presented that there was associate improvement in terms of students' motivation and interest during this speaking class.

To find out what grade of education level can apply youtube video media, the researcher presented some sources based on the majority population who had



already applied the youtube video media. The first researcher was Lia Selfia Yunita. In her research, the population of this research was all of the second grade students at Mts Psm Mirigambar, Tulungagung. There was one class VIII A class consisted of 16 students at that grade as the subjects of this research. The second researcher was Alfi Qurrota A'yunina. In her research, the research subject of this research was the second grade students MTs Assyafi'iyah Gondang in the academic year 2017/2018. The populations were 70 students taken from VIII A class and VIII B class. The third researcher was Muhammad Sirrul Muna. In his research, the populations were at the XI Grade Students of SMK Negeri 3 Surakarta, Academic Year 2010/2011. There were 40 students. The fourth researcher was Syifa' Khuriyatuz Zahro. In her research, the populations in his research were all students in Darul Ulum Islamic University. The populations involved in this research were 59 students. The fifth researcher was Diki Riswandi. In his research, the populations were the students of the VII grade of junior high schools in Surakarta. This class consisted of 28 students. The sixth researcher was Yunda Lestari. In her research, the populations were the second semester students of Management Study Program of Economic Faculty, the total number 132 students. The sample of the study was 64 students. The seventh researcher was Elhadi Nasr Elhadi Mustafa. In his research, the population of the researcher was 22 beginner students from Arab Open University. The eighth researcher was Riyadh branch, Euis Meinawati, Nazzala Aulia Rahmah, Danang Dwi Harmoko, Nurmala Dewi. In the research, the analysis began with teaching speaking for 10th grade using media YouTube in SMA IT Rahmadiyah. Procedures of the analysis began with observation. The ninth of researcher was Muhammad Ilyas, Miranti Eka Putri. In the research, the population was 48 students at English language study program of Universitas Islam Riau. The tenth researcher was Ida Prasetianing Jati, Alis Saukah, Nunung Suryati. In her research, the population was 21 students of SMPN 1 Ngoro.

Based on the research result above, this study was intended to the effectiveness of using youtube video to improve students' speaking skill. As presented by the results of this study, literature review revealed data collection, data analysis, and results. The results presented the significant differences before and after using youtube video in teaching English speaking. The post-test scores presented much better than the pre-test one so that the use of youtube video media is effective to improve speaking skill.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the results of previous research and research discussion that the success of the teaching of speaking is decided by some factors. One of the factors is kind of media used by the teacher within the class. The use of YouTube videos might be an alternative since it provides materials for speaking class freely and easily. The various topics and frequencies of speaking supporting media like YouTube can facilitate the students to improve their speaking achievement. The use of YouTube videos can be an opportunity because it offers correctly and clearly speaking resources while helping to develop the fluency of the students in speaking. Many things that are improved include fluency, vocabulary, pronunciation, grammar, and quality of the students. Youtube video media cannot only be extended to children but can also be adapted to all ages, as well as allowing students to learn their own speaking skill in English language easily.

Commented [h2]: Revise your conclusion which does not conclude with the content of the study result

## REFERENCES

- A'yunina, R. A. Q. (2018). The Effectiveness of Using Youtube Video on The Second Grade Students' Speaking Ability in Recount Text at Mts Assyafi'iyah Gondang: State Islamic Institute of Tulungagung.
- Meinawati, Euis, R. N. A., Harmoko, Danang Dwi, & Dewi, N. (2020). Increasing English Speaking Skills Through Youtube. *Jurnal Ilmiah*, 16, 1-13.
- Jati, Ida Prasetianing, S. A. Suryati, Suryati, Nunung. (2019). Teaching Using Youtube Tutorial Video to Improve Students' Speaking Skills. *Jurnal Pendidikan Humaniora*, 7, 101-116.
- Kitchenham, B. (2004). *Procedures for Performing Systematic Reviews*. Eversleigh: Keele University.
- Lestari, Y. (2019). English Youtube Channel in Enhancing Students' Speaking Skill. *Exposure Journal*, 8, 39-47.
- Ilyas, Muhammad P. M. E. (2020). Youtube Channel: an Alternative Social Media to Enhance Efl Students' Speaking Skill. *Journal of English For Academic*, 7, 77-87.
- Muna, M. S. (2011). Utilizing Youtube Videos to Enhance Students' Speaking Skill. Sebelas Maret University Surakarta,
- Mustafa, E. N. E. (2018). The Impact of Youtube, Skype and Whatsapp in Improving Efl Learners' Speaking Skill. *International Journal of Contemporary Applied Researches*, 5, 18-31.
- N. Goagoses and U. Koglin. Olaf Zawacki-Richter, M. K., Svenja Bedenlier, Melissa Bond, Katja Buntins Eds. (2020). *Systematic Reviews in Educational Research*, . Abraham-Lincoln-Str. 46, 65189 Wiesbaden, Germany Springer Vs Imprint
- Riswandi, D. (2016). Use of Youtube-Based Videos to Improve Students' Speaking Skill. 2 296-306.
- Zahro, Syifa' Khuriyatuz, T. F. S. (2019). The Development of Educational Youtube Videos-Based Instructional Material for Speaking for Beginner Course. *Ijet (Indonesian Journal of English Teaching)*, 8, 48-56.
- Yunita, L. S. (2015). The Effectiveness of Using Video Youtube Toward Students' Speaking Ability at The Second Grade of Mts Psm Mirigambar, Tulungagung. Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teacher Training State Islamic Institute (Iain) of Tulungagung
- Saputri, T. (2017). Improving The Students' Speaking Skill Through Humanistic Strategies in ECC of Unusa. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pendidikan : Tema "Desain Pembelajaran Di Era Asean Economic Community (Aec)*, 388-398

# artikel

---

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

---

23%

SIMILARITY INDEX

22%

INTERNET SOURCES

4%

PUBLICATIONS

10%

STUDENT PAPERS

---

## PRIMARY SOURCES

---

1	<a href="http://jurnal.uns.ac.id">jurnal.uns.ac.id</a> Internet Source	6%
2	<a href="http://repo.iain-tulungagung.ac.id">repo.iain-tulungagung.ac.id</a> Internet Source	5%
3	<a href="http://english.fkip.uns.ac.id">english.fkip.uns.ac.id</a> Internet Source	2%
4	Submitted to Udayana University Student Paper	2%
5	<a href="http://journal.unismuh.ac.id">journal.unismuh.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
6	<a href="http://www.ijcar.net">www.ijcar.net</a> Internet Source	1%
7	<a href="http://journal.um.ac.id">journal.um.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
8	<a href="http://repository.unusa.ac.id">repository.unusa.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
9	Submitted to Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha Student Paper	1%

---

10 core.ac.uk 1 %  
Internet Source

---

11 journal.ubm.ac.id 1 %  
Internet Source

---

12 www.scilit.net 1 %  
Internet Source

---

13 ojs.unimal.ac.id 1 %  
Internet Source

---

14 repository.uinsu.ac.id 1 %  
Internet Source

---

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches < 1%

Exclude bibliography On